

Annex D

Comments and Responses

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Comment from EPD as detailed in letter ref (12) in Ax(1) to EP2/G/G/131 Pt.31 dated 5th August 2022

Item	Comments	Responses
1.	While zoom-in plans on selected portions of the project are provided, a master layout plan (MLP) with appropriate scale and legend clearly indicating the location and height (in meters/mPD) of all proposed buildings/ structures/ features of the project is missing, making the readers difficult to have an overall concept of the development. The Consultant should provide a MLP making reference to Figure 2.4 of the Approved EIA Report.	Please refer to additional drawing nos. IWMF1_10-130_990_000200 and IWMF1_10-130_990_000250 in Annex B which demonstrate the whole site with appropriate scale and legend indicating the locations and heights of all proposed buildings/structures/features of the project, with references made to Figure 2.4 of the Approved EIA Report.
2.	The building layout/height in the current submission seems different from that in the Approved EIA Report. The Consultant should briefly clarify and explain such changes in the main text of the report.	Please refer to the additional drawing nos. IWMF1_10-130_990_000200 and IWMF1_10-130_990_000250 in Annex B with the design building/structure heights. Furthermore, refer to the revised Section 6.1 for additional text briefly explaining such changes and the ideas behind.
3.	While mitigation measures are of utmost concern, the mitigation measures plan is still missing in this current submission despite our previous comment. The Consultant should make reference to Figure 10b.10 of the Approved EIA Report.	Please refer to drawing no. IWMF1-LVP-01 in Annex B for the overall Mitigation Measures Plan based on the current mitigation measures and design, based on Figure 10b.10 of the Approved EIA Report.
4.	The Chimney is the most eye-catching feature of the project from many VSRs, its height and dimensions are, however, missing in the current submission.	The Chimney is 23.765m x 16.10m in elliptical form in its cross section with a height is at around +156.0mPD. Please refer to drawing nos. IWMF1_10-130_990_000250 and IWMF1_11-135_400_044011 for the overall site layout plan with its height and its cross-sectional layout plan for your reference.
5.	It is difficult for us to ascertain the accuracy of the photomontages without the above said information.	The LVP has been revised with the introduction of overall site layout plans to facilitate the presentation of the photomontages.
	Specific comments	
6.	Section 6. 7 - The design of the breakwaters is unclear from the distant view in Figure 6.6. Please provide reference	Section 6.7 is revised to include references to the High Island Reservoir interlocking precast concrete armouring units for reference.

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Item	Comments	Responses
	photo at High Island Reservoir to help illustrate the proposed design of interlocking concrete armouring units.	
7.	Figure 6.8 – The brown structure and painting/mural found along the seawall (marked on the Attachment) were not mentioned in the Approved EIA Report nor the current submission. Please describe such feature/design and explain their purposes in the main text.	Section 6.1 has been revised to elaborate on the painting/mural feature which is to depict a sailboat/marine theme to blend in with the surrounding environment.
8.	<p>Table 7.1-</p> <p>a) The Consultant is reminded to indicate the Tree Top Walk, Viewing Platform, green roof, pedestrian pathway, sky deck structure, passenger reception pier, landscaped berms, and forested berms in the MLP and/or Mitigation Measures Plan with proper annotations for clarity sake.</p> <p>b) MLVC-04(3) and MVC-01(3 to 5) - With reference to the Consultant's responses in Annex C (especially Item nos. c, d, e, m), please supplement the table to explain why the features recommended in the Approved EIA Report, including landscape deck at the stack, gradient colour for the chimney, observation deck at the top of the chimney, and sky gardens between the stacks, were not provided/adopted. The Consultant should also justify the effectiveness of the alternative design/mitigation measures adopted in the current submission in minimizing the visual impact from the project.</p> <p>c) MVO-01 - It should read " Education Centre located inside the Administration Building</p>	<p>a) Please refer to drawing no. IWWMF1_10-130_990_000200 and IWWMF1-LVP-01 in Annex B which now indicate the aforementioned features for clarity;</p> <p>b) – Landscape features and observation deck of the Chimney are proposed to be relocated and incorporated into the south facing seawall forming part of the external visitor's path, named as "Sky Deck". The current design is considered to be more environmentally friendly, in which the configuration of the Chimney stack is streamlined into an aerodynamic form to address the wind load effectively. Furthermore, the landscaped Sky Deck is more accessible for the public and from the maintenance point of view;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To mitigate the form of the Chimney, asymmetrical external aluminum panels are cladded on its concrete structure to resemble a sail of a boat to form a feature in order to symbolise the Hong Kong spirit overcoming high and low tides for a better future. Being the first facility of its kind, the endorsed concept of IWWMF1 is “一帆風順 領航前行” (aka “smooth sailing, with great stewardship forward”); - The cladding is slightly projected from the concrete structure, so that its shadow will be cast on the stack with slightly varied under different weather conditions and time of day, thus creating interesting visual impressions; - For the front and back of the seawalls facing the South China Sea, various shades of blue in a wavy pattern and a brown paint

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Item	Comments	Responses
		<p>represent a timber boat sailing on the sea;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Color pattern of the wavewall will breakdown the scale of the facility's enormity when visitors come near to the artificial island during a visit; - The said design concept and images of the Chimney have been presented to the stakeholders, including the Community Liaison Group, who have no objections on the updated design intention; and - The avoid maintenance issues on the external paint, budget consideration and to facilitate the programme, it is proposed to utilise the cladding and painted seawall rather than the gradual paint on the stack to enhance the overall visual impact of the complex. <p>c) Noted and the text for MVO-01 is revised.</p>
9.	<p>Annex A Part 2 –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) The discrepancies persisted in the current submission. They are marked in the Attachment. It should be reminded that it is the Consultant's responsibility to check and ensure the consistency of the report. b) According to the photomontages in the Approved EIA report, portions of the project would be visible from VSR 6 (Cheung Po Tsai Cave, Cheung Chau), VSR 7 (Cheung Chau Ferry Pier), VSR 10 (Lantau Trail Stage 3), and VSR 14 (Tai Long Wan). However, they are not reflected in the current submission (marked in the Attachment). Please double check the accuracy of the photomontages and explain such differences. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) The comment is noted and the Report is reviewed for clarity and consistency, the remarks from your Attachment have been amended; and b) Please refer to the revised photomontages of the VSRs 6, 7, 10 and 14.
10.	<p>Please find below our comments on the revised LVP submission from landscape impact perspective:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) to facilitate our review, please provide a combined layout plan in legible scale with clear legends illustrating the proposed landscape elements, including new tree planting, shrub planting, ground cover planting, grass paver, vertical greening etc. The corresponding mitigation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Please refer to drawing no. IWWMF1_10-130_990_000200 in Annex B for the combined layout and no. IWWMF1_10-130_990_000200 for the proposed building spot heights; the zoomed-in plans in Annex B illustrating both soft and hard landscape designs of the project; and drawing no. IWWMF1-LVP-01 in Annex B for the names of the buildings and other structures, drawing no. IWWMF1-LVP-02 provides another

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Item	Comments	Responses
	<p>measures proposed under the approved EIA should be annotated on the combined plan. Please add reference information such as names of the buildings and other structures and the proposed spot heights; and</p> <p>(b) please add a summary table under section 5 of the report showing the approx. no. of new tree, area of shrub, ground cover and vertical greening proposed respectively.</p>	<p>layout plan to illustrate the new greenery planting; and</p> <p>b) Please refer to the additional Table 5.1 – summary table.</p>

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Comment From EPD as detailed in letter ref (12) in Ax(1) to EPG/G131 Pt.31 dated 16 December 2022

Item	Comments	Responses															
1.	Section 2.1 - The following circulars are either superseded or subsumed by updated circulars: i) Please delete WTBC No. 7/2002 ii) ETWB TCW No. 34/2003 to be updated as DEVB TC(W) No. 5/2017 iii) ETWB TCW No. 02/2004 to be updated as DEVB TC(W) No. 6/2015 iv) ETWB TCW No. 29/2004 to be updated as DEVB TC(W) No. 5/2020 v) DEVB TC(W) No. 10/2013 to be updated as DEVB TC(W) No. 4/2020	The circulars are updated in the revised Section. i) Deleted; ii) Amended; iii) Amended; iv) Amended; and v) Amended.															
2.	Section 5.5 - It is noted that there are "4 distant and different planting zones, namely the Woodland Mass Planting, Coastal Green Buffer, Roof Garden Ornamental Planting and Leisure Gardens", please indicate on Drawing No. LVP_3_017600 (Planting Schedule and Image) the proposed tree species for each of the planting zone and indicate on plan the proposed planting zones.	The 4 nos. different Zones are further elaborated in Section 5.5 in the resubmission. These Zones are also demarcated in the revised drawing no. IWMF-LVP-02 in Annex B. For the sake of clarity, the proposed tree species for each of the planting zone indicated on the following plans and tree schedule: <table border="1" data-bbox="829 1066 1356 1459"> <thead> <tr> <th>Zone</th> <th>Tree Planting Plan (Dwg. No.)</th> <th>Tree Schedule (Dwg. No.)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Coastal Green Buffer</td> <td>IWMF1_14-</td> <td>IWMF1_14-</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Woodland Mass Planting</td> <td>136_990_113708 to IWMF1_14-136_990_113723</td> <td>136_990_117600</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Leisure Gardens</td> <td>Process Building on podium IWMF1_14-136_300_123601 to IWMF1_14-136_300_123603 Administration Building IWMF1_14-136_800_123601 and IWMF1_14-136_800_123605</td> <td>IWMF1_14-136_300_117600 IWMF1_14-136_800_117600</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Roof Garden Ornamental Greening</td> <td>No tree planting proposed</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Zone	Tree Planting Plan (Dwg. No.)	Tree Schedule (Dwg. No.)	Coastal Green Buffer	IWMF1_14-	IWMF1_14-	Woodland Mass Planting	136_990_113708 to IWMF1_14-136_990_113723	136_990_117600	Leisure Gardens	Process Building on podium IWMF1_14-136_300_123601 to IWMF1_14-136_300_123603 Administration Building IWMF1_14-136_800_123601 and IWMF1_14-136_800_123605	IWMF1_14-136_300_117600 IWMF1_14-136_800_117600	Roof Garden Ornamental Greening	No tree planting proposed	
Zone	Tree Planting Plan (Dwg. No.)	Tree Schedule (Dwg. No.)															
Coastal Green Buffer	IWMF1_14-	IWMF1_14-															
Woodland Mass Planting	136_990_113708 to IWMF1_14-136_990_113723	136_990_117600															
Leisure Gardens	Process Building on podium IWMF1_14-136_300_123601 to IWMF1_14-136_300_123603 Administration Building IWMF1_14-136_800_123601 and IWMF1_14-136_800_123605	IWMF1_14-136_300_117600 IWMF1_14-136_800_117600															
Roof Garden Ornamental Greening	No tree planting proposed																
3.	The number of tree planting and tree species of Table 5.1, Table 5.2 and Drawing No. LVP_3_017600 (Planting Schedule and Image) do not tally with each other. Please review.	The comments is noted and please note that the total numbers of tree planting (i.e. 595) correspond in these sections of the report as follows: - Table 5.1: total = 595; - Table 5.2: 555 (LMP) + 27 (Process Building) + 13 (Admin Building) = 595; and Annex B: 555 (IWMF1_14-136_990_117600) + 27 (IWMF1_14-136_300_117600) + 13 (IWMF1_14-136_800_117600) = 595.															

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Item	Comments	Responses
4.	<p>Noting that large scale vertical greening is proposed for all facade of the Process Building, MT Plant Building & Water Treatment Plant Building and Admin Building. Please provide the proposed planting species, sectional details of the vertical greening with proper drainage and irrigation system to demonstrate the practicability and proper maintenance accesses for long term healthy and sustainable growth of the proposed greening for review.</p>	<p>Whilst the vertical greening (VG) are indicated in red borders in the elevation drawing of individual drawings in the Annex B, the VG typical section showing the drainage, irrigation system and maintenance access is added also in Annex B (Drawing no. IWMF1_14-136_990_124102).</p> <p>Further elaboration of the VG system design is added to Section 6.4, 1st paragraph.</p>
5.	<p>Drawing No. IWMF1-LVP-01 (Overall Landscape Master Plan)</p> <p>i) The drawing is blur and unclear. The drawing should be in the scale of 1:1000 and should include the whole project limit. ii) Clear indication of mitigation measures (i.e. MLVC-01 to 04, MVC-01, MLVO-01 and MVO-01) proposed under the approved EIA should be annotated on plan. iii) Proper legends of landscape elements such as trees, shrubs/groundcover and lawn should be provided. iv) The "Project Limit" and "Setting-out Line" under legend are missing. v) Spot levels for all landscape areas (both at-grade and on-structure) should be provided.</p>	<p>i) The drawing is now in 1:1000 scale with scale bar; ii) Mitigations MLVC-01 to 04, MVC-01, MLVO-01 and MVO-01 are annotated on Drawing No. IWMF1-LVP-01; iii) Landscape element legends are added on Drawing No. IWMF1-LVP-01; iv) The legend has been updated with the missing information in Drawing No. IWMF1-LVP-01; and v) Further spot levels have been added to Drawing no. IWMF1-LVP-01.</p>
6.	<p>Drawing No. IWMF1-LVP-02</p> <p>i) The drawing title is missing. ii) Separate legends for shrubs/groundcover and lawn should be provided.</p>	<p>i) The Drawing title is now added; and ii) Separate legends are now applicable for shrubs/ground cover, lawn and trees. Reference is also made to drawing no. IWMF1-LVP-01 and the enlarged building-specific drawings contained within Annex B.</p>

Integrated Waste Management Facilities, Phase 1
Landscape and Visual Plan

Item	Comments	Responses
7.	As advised by the Urban Design Unit, the annotations for mitigation measures seem missing from Drawing No. IWWMF1-LVPO-01. Please rectify.	iii) Please note the mitigation measures are included in Drawing No. IWWMF1-LVP-01 and other drawings within Annex B.

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Overall Site Configuration / Layout

Figure 1.2 General overview of the IWMF development and adjacent Shek Kwu Chau Island from the South.

Figure 1.3 General overview of the IWMF development and adjacent Shek Kwu Chau Island from the West.

Figure 5.1 East Courtyard

Figure 5.2 West Courtyard

Figure 6.1 General Aesthetic treatment of the IWMF development featuring the seawall in the foreground, landscaped development with vertical greening in the mid field and the iconic sail format chimney structure.

Figure 6.2 Green wall modular concept.

Figure 6.3 Mature green wall overall impression.

Figure 6.4 General outlook from the visitor viewing gallery

Figure 6.5 Chimney concept

Figure 6.6 Visual appearance of the Breakwaters

Figure 6.7 Eco-shoreline concept along the seawall facing Shek Kwu Chau Island

Figure 6.8 Overall view of Seawalls and Breakwater

Figures 6.9 Seawall Configuration

Figures 6.10 Depicting the a) South East, b) North West, c) North d) South and e) South west elevations at the Main Process Building.MT and WTP Building

Figures 6.11 Green roof of the Main Process Building

Figures 6.12 Views from of the MT and WTP Building.

Figures 6.13 Administration Building

Figures 6.14 IWMF Substation

Figures 6.15 Reception Pavilion